



www.smwm.com

415 546 0400 T  
415 882 7098 F

April 13, 2006

**Lamphier Gregory**1944 Embarcadero  
Oakland, CA 94606  
Attn. Scott Gregory**Re: Design Review Kaiser MOB**

Project: Kaiser Master Plan # 20518.01

This evaluation is based upon information in the plans and illustrations (100% Design Development Set) submitted to SMWM in December 2005 and colored plans, sections, elevations, and perspectives submitted to SMWM March 30, 2006.

**Building Massing**

- The massing of the proposed MOB on the corner of West MacArthur and Broadway is not sufficiently articulated and does not address that major intersection.
- The proposed attached parking garage of four floors and five parking decks for the MOB extends almost  $\frac{3}{4}$  of the block and is out of scale with the surrounding neighborhood.
- The height of the MOB and the parking garage is problematic in relation to the adjacent Manila neighborhood. They do not provide any transition in scale or massing to the neighborhood.
- There is poor integration between the massing of the MOB and the parking garage. They appear as separate and unrelated structures.
- The small retail structure on the corner of Broadway and 38<sup>th</sup> Street at the parking structure is too small in relation the parking garage façade behind it. The lack of height and depth of this retail also fails to help the parking garage step down along Broadway towards 38<sup>th</sup> Street.

**Street Frontage**

- The proposed MOB and its associated parking garage attempt to hold the street wall along Broadway and West MacArthur Boulevard. However, the light wells along Broadway and the landscape setback along MacArthur make the building feel disengaged with the street.
- The grade along West MacArthur falls away from the sidewalk creating a poor urban relationship to the street. The height of the exposed concrete "plinth" at the base of the building ranges from 4' to 12' high and could be better articulated.
- The proposed MOB has an exit stair and pathway placed at the prominent corner at Broadway and West MacArthur. This is a corner that deserves more activity and more transparency from the building in order to address that important intersection.
- The lack of active uses along the ground floor of the MOB will inhibit the potential for a vibrant street frontage along Broadway and West MacArthur. The proposed ground floor retail associated with the parking garage along Broadway does not provide enough retail street frontage in order to encourage activity. The proposed retail along Broadway in the parking garage is designed to be provided in the last phase of the master plan and raises doubts that it will ever go into the garage.

- The small retail on the corner of 38<sup>th</sup> and Broadway is too small to provide any substantial street activity that the architects envision and raises questions as to whether the space will be rentable.

## **Building Facades/ Building Elevations**

### Manila

- The MOB and the parking garage that face the Manila neighborhood require more articulation in order to help break down its scale. The punched windows along the façade of the MOB provide a relentless and uninteresting elevation to the small scale and diversity of architectural massing and detailing within the neighborhood.
- It is unclear as to whether the vine screens will have their desired intent to the screen building. Examples of where these vines thrive in these conditions should be shown.

### West Macarthur

- The punched windows along this street present an unrelenting and uninteresting façade to the street. The unarticulated corner of the building, at West Macarthur and Broadway, fails to address an important intersection in the city. The exist stair and doorway placed on this important corner only exacerbates this failure.
- The elevation fails to address West Macarthur and is focused on Broadway. There should be more transparency along this façade. One solution is to pull more of the larger windows placed along Broadway toward West Macarthur and to better articulate the ground floor as the concrete “plinth” does not adequately provide enough interest.

### Broadway

- The large recess in the façade focuses the building only towards Broadway.
- The scale of the large recess makes the building seem massive and out of scale with the street.
- The parking signage along Broadway is too large and prominent and only serves as a reminder as to the large scale of the garage.

### 38<sup>th</sup> Street

- The large unarticulated façade of the parking garage behind the small retail is very visible from the street, particularly as one walks down either side of Broadway to Mosswood Park.
- The lack of openings and recesses for the garage on this side exacerbate the large scale of the garage.

## **Parking and Service/Loading**

- The associated parking garage for the proposed MOB on Broadway is incompatible with the adjacent neighborhood through its large size, scale, length and lack of sufficient pedestrian oriented amenities along the street.

- Strategies for providing more underground parking include integrating more parking into the proposed MOB building or adding another subterranean parking level in order to minimize the length of the above ground parking structure.
- The small parking lot provided along Manila Avenue seems an unnecessary element in the surrounding neighborhood given the amount of parking provided elsewhere within the project.
- The number of ingress and egress lanes from the garage creates a large void at ground level along Broadway. Given that the ticketing is on the second floor and that a right turn only out of the garage is proposed, reducing that the number of lanes should be considered in order to minimize the amount of openings along the parking garage.
- Having the service loading for the building off West Macarthur raises questions as to how trucks will back into loading space without stopping traffic along the street.

### **Materials**

- The stucco or cement plaster proposed for the MOB is not a suitable durable material for a permanent health care facility. This material also raises questions of how the materials of this building will eventually relate to the new hospital and to the rest of the proposed campus architecture. Other higher quality materials should be investigated such as metal panels that would help to break down the scale and massing of the building and provide a great sense of permanence.
- The exposed concrete of the garage serves to only emphasize its banality and massiveness as a parking garage and is not a suitable material for this neighborhood area. Cladding the parking garage with higher quality materials that are more integrated with the MOB and the other new hospital buildings should be considered.

### **Sustainability**

- It is not clear from the Master Plan if all or any buildings are intended to be LEED certified or the degree of sustainable measures that are to be incorporated into the design. Sustainable LEED measures are encouraged at scales of both the site plan and building.

### **Open Space/Landscape**

- The renderings show a very lush landscape program but do raise doubts as to whether the trees will grow to their assumed height and fullness in this urban condition.
- It is still questionable as to the viability of the vine screens. Information on successful examples in this type of condition should be provided.