

Project Name:	Kaiser Permanente, Broadway Medical Office Building and Parking Garage
Location:	Generally the western side of the 3700 block of Broadway between West MacArthur Boulevard and 38 th Street, plus two extensions of these properties through the mid-block to Manila Avenue
Proposal:	Kaiser Permanente has requested Design Review approval for their Phase I Medical Office Building
Applicant:	Kaiser Permanente, Kaiser Foundation Health Plan Michael Lane, Project Director, Kaiser Permanente (510) 987-2373
Owner:	Kaiser Permanente, plus 1 additional property on Broadway yet to be acquired by Kaiser
Case File Number:	CMD06-284
General Plan:	Institutional
Zoning:	KX (Kaiser Permanente Zone)
Historic Status:	No historic structures
Environmental Determination:	A Draft EIR was released on March 2, 2006 and the public comment period on the Draft EIR ended on April 17, 2006. The Final EIR was released on May 26, 2006. The EIR was certified by the Oakland Planning Commission on June 6, 2006
Service District:	North Oakland
City Council District:	1 (north of MacArthur)
Staff Recommendation:	That the Planning Commission approve Design Review for the Phase 1 Broadway Medical Office Building and parking garage subject to the conditions, requirements, and findings contained in the staff report.
For further information:	Contact: Scott Gregory , contract planner to the City at 510-535-6690, or by email at kaiser@lamphier-gregory.com

SUMMARY

The purpose of this report is to consider Design Review approval for Phase 1 of the Kaiser Oakland Medical Center (OMC) Master Plan. Phase 1 of the Kaiser OMC Master Plan (*Phase 1*) consists of a 165,000 square foot medical office building with an associated parking garage that includes street-level retail use. Staff recommends approval of Design Review subject to the attached Conditions of Approval.

BACKGROUND

The Kaiser Permanente Oakland Medical Center (OMC) is generally defined as the area surrounding the intersection of Broadway and West MacArthur Boulevard. It includes the existing Kaiser Hospital and associated facilities, the MacArthur/Broadway Center (M/B Center), and the eastern side of the 3700 block of Broadway. In early spring of 2005, Kaiser Permanente/Kaiser Foundation Health Plan proposed a new Kaiser Permanente Oakland Medical Center (OMC) Master Plan to guide the phased replacement of the existing Kaiser Medical Center with a new medical center campus of approximately 1.78 million square feet on approximately 21 acres. A summary of the planning process for this project follows:

Master Plan and EIR

- A Notice of Preparation of an Environmental Impact Report (NOP) was prepared by the City and distributed on April 1, 2005 and a Scoping Session was held before the Planning Commission on April 13, 2005.
- On March 3, 2006 the City prepared a Draft Environmental Impact Report (DEIR) that was released for a 47-day public review period, which closed on April 17, 2006. A Final EIR including responses to all comments on the Draft EIR was prepared and published on May 26, 2006.
- On June 7, 2006 the Oakland City Planning Commission voted to certify the EIR and recommended (with modifications) that the Oakland City Council/Redevelopment Agency approve a General Plan Amendment, a Redevelopment Plan Amendment, Rezoning and approval of the Kaiser OMC Master Plan (the Project).
- On June 13, 2006 the Oakland City Council Community and Economic Development Committee (CEDC) voted to recommend approval (with further modifications) of the Project.
- On June 27, 2006 the Oakland City Council/Redevelopment Agency approved the General Plan Amendment and Redevelopment Plan Amendment, and held the first reading to approve the proposed rezoning and Kaiser OMC Master Plan.
- On July 18, 2006 the Oakland City Council approved on second reading the proposed rezoning and Kaiser OMC Master Plan.

Design Review Process

- On July 5th the Design Review Committee was presented with the first design plans for Kaiser's proposed Phase 1 MOB and associated parking garage. The Committee heard public testimony and identified certain design issues that they felt needed more work or further consideration.
- On July 26th the Design Review Committee was presented with a design response by Kaiser's architects. The Committee expressed certain reservations regarding the design but felt that the design was ready to be considered by the full Planning Commission.
- On September 6th the Planning Commission considered Phase 1 Design Review Approval. At that meeting there was no clear consensus for design approval, and instead the Commission referred the

project back to the Design Review Committee for further work and public input. The staff report for this last Planning Commission hearing on this item is included as *Attachment A*.

- On September 27th the Design Review Committee discussed their primary design concerns with the Phase 1 MOB and parking garage and heard additional public input on design issues. The Committee recommended that Kaiser and their architects meet with staff and interested members of the public to follow-up on the Committee's expressed design concerns and arrive at design solutions. The staff report for the last Design Review Committee hearing on this item is included as *Attachment B*.
- On October 5th staff did meet with Kaiser's design team to discuss the Committee's key design issues and to develop design solutions that may be satisfactory to the Planning Commission. Also on October 5th staff and Kaiser's design team met with members of the public to further discuss and resolve certain outstanding design issues (see discussion of Design Review Issues below).

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Property Description

The Phase 1 site is approximately 3.6 acres, generally defined as the westerly side of the 3700 block of Broadway between West MacArthur Boulevard and 38th Street. It consists primarily of those properties fronting onto Broadway, but also includes two parcels extending westward to Manila Avenue.

The area surrounding the project site has been fully described in the September 6th Planning Commission staff report (Attachment A).

Project Description: West Broadway Medical Office Building and Parking Garage

Phase 1 of the Master Plan provides for a new West Broadway Medical Office Building (MOB) and its associated parking. New construction is proposed to include:

- At the corner of West MacArthur Boulevard and Broadway is the MOB, approximately 165,000 square feet in size and 5-stories (approximately 86 feet tall) at its highest point.
- Approximately 7,700 square feet of retail space is proposed to be located along the Broadway street frontage from the parking garage entry to 38th Street. The street level retail use is included in the design and construction of Phase 1, and Kaiser is required to actively market this space.
- A parking garage is proposed to be located both above and below the Broadway frontage retail space. At a minimum, the parking facility is required to be capable of meeting the parking needs associated with the programmed use of the MOB (estimated at approximately 438 spaces), although more parking spaces (approximately 520) are included as part of Kaiser's proposed design.
- A passive-use park / serenity garden is proposed for the portion of the site that extends into the Manila neighborhoods and fronts onto Manila Avenue.

Construction of the Phase 1 MOB and parking garage would enable Kaiser to move existing medical office uses that currently occupy the M/B Center tower to this new site, and would re-supply a large portion of existing parking supply that would otherwise be lost from the M/B Center. Once relocated, Kaiser could then begin demolition of the existing M/B Center and construction of the new hospital.

Planning Analysis

General Plan Consistency

The proposed Phase 1 MOB and its associated parking garage are consistent with the *Institutional* land use classification, as more fully discussed in the September 6, 2006 staff report (Attachment A).

Zoning Conformance

The proposed Phase 1 MOB and its associated parking garage are consistent with the zoning requirements of the *Kaiser Permanente Oakland Medical Center (KX)* zoning district that apply to this site, as also more fully discussed in the September 6, 2006 staff report (Attachment A).

Findings and Conditions of Approval

Section 17.XX.060 of the KX Zoning District requires that Design Review approval be granted only if the proposal is found to be in substantial conformance to the *Kaiser Permanente Oakland Medical Center Master Plan* including without limitation its goals, objectives, principles and guidelines, as well as a number of additional City design review criteria. Findings for Phase 1 Design Review approval pursuant to the Oakland Planning Code, the Kaiser KX zoning district, the Kaiser OMC Master Plan and CEQA Guidelines Section 15075 are included in the Design Review and CEQA Findings (**Attachment C** to this staff report).

The Kaiser Permanente OMC Master Plan was approved with a number of Conditions of Approval and a Mitigation Monitoring Program. Many of these conditions of approval and mitigation measures specifically pertain to the Phase 1 site. These conditions of approval, mitigation measures and additional conditions pursuant to this Design Review approval are included in the Conditions of Approval (**Attachment D** to this staff report).

Environmental Review

In taking action on this Design Review application, staff recommends that the Planning Commission review, consider and rely upon the *EIR for the Kaiser Permanente OMC Master Plan Project* as certified by the Commission on June 7, 2006. Staff also recommends that the Commission make findings (as included in Attachment C to this staff report) that this Design Review application is within the scope of the previously approved EIR for the project, that the previous EIR adequately describes the current approval for purposes of CEQA, and that no change has occurred that requires preparation of a subsequent or supplemental EIR.

DESIGN REVIEW ISSUES

Previously Resolved Design Issues

It is staff's understanding that several design issues have generally been resolved through prior DRC and Commission hearings on this item. These resolved design issues include:

1. The location (the new medical office building will be at the corner of West MacArthur Boulevard and Broadway) size (approximately 165,000 square feet medical office space and 7,700 square feet of retail) and height (5-stories, approximately 86 feet tall at its highest point) of the MOB.
2. The function of this building as a medical office space may dictate or define certain aspects of the external space (i.e., window locations and spacing, entrance location, etc).
3. A free-standing parking garage will be located adjacent to the MOB. An integrated building design has been dismissed.
4. Pedestrian-oriented retail will occupy the street level of the parking garage, from the parking garage entry to 38th Street.
5. The height of the parking garage will be defined as 2 stories of parking (3 decks with roof-top parking) over the first-floor of retail frontage along Broadway, resulting in a maximum height of the parking garage of 3 stories. There will be 2 levels of underground parking. This structure contains approximately 520 parking spaces (or about 580 spaces if valet parking is used).
6. The property that extends from the MOB to Manila Avenue is to be developed as a passive park / private open space area.
7. The Glen Echo Creek Restoration Plan was previously approved by the Commission on September 6th.
8. The landscape and streetscape plans provide attractive and functional street front landscaping, median landscaping, street/sidewalk improvements and landscape screening. The landscape plan utilizes setbacks to promote streetscape activities and provide public open space along MacArthur Boulevard and Broadway.

Kaiser's Most Recent Response to Remaining Design Issues

As of the September 27th DRC Committee meeting there were several design issues that remained unresolved. Since then, staff has met with Kaiser's design team and members of the public to seek resolution of these issues. The following is a summary of Kaiser's most current design responses to these issues, as shown in their November Design Review Submittal (**Attachment E**).

A. Design Theme of the Blue Frame

Commissioners have expressed a lack of satisfaction with the Broadway (east) elevation, suggesting that the building was "uninteresting", "appeared more suburban than urban in character", that the Broadway/MacArthur corner "deserved more design attention given its prominent location", and that the proposed blue stucco frame wrapping the staircases on either end of the building "did not set the

appropriate tone for the overall development within the OMC campus.” Suggestions by the Commission included use of more glass, and/or using a different and perhaps more permanent material for the blue framing along the Broadway façade.

November submittal: Kaiser’s most recent design response represents a significant change in the building design. The southerly end of the ‘blue frame’ has been removed and replaced by a wall of glass windows stretching from the ground floor to near the top of the building. The glass wall also wraps around to the MacArthur (south) facade. In order to achieve this change, the internal staircase was relocated inward and each of the office floor plans shifted to accommodate the staircase. The top portion of the ‘blue frame’ has been significantly reduced in height and stepped back onto the roof to act as a parapet wall shielding rooftop equipment. The top of the building now shows as a much thinner sand-colored band running continuously from the northerly building edge all the way around and connecting to the MacArthur façade.

The added glass and reduced massing of the blue frame gives the building a lighter appearance, perhaps more urban in character. It also provides for a more active and transparent corner for this prominent location. Although not established as a requirement, the substantial amount of glass that provides transparency and visible activity at this building, particularly at the Broadway/MacArthur corner, may act as precedent or set the tone for the design of the lower floors of the future hospital building in Phase 2.

B. Architectural Interest and Articulation, Manila and MacArthur Elevations

Many previous comments expressed by the Commissioners indicated their opinion that the building facades particularly along MacArthur and Manila were “too flat and required more (or different) articulation in order to help break down their scale”, and were “uninteresting or not orderly.” Other comments include; “The elevations of the MOB facing Manila Avenue and MacArthur Boulevard had too many small punch windows, and a few irregular window treatments that looked look forced, not integrated” and “the west and south elevation facing Manila and West MacArthur Boulevard have too much mass and need to be broken down visually.”

November submittal: Kaiser’s most recent design response provides for a number of design changes to address these concerns:

- The window pattern is now a regular sequence of window spacing that corresponds to the internal office space uses. The pattern’s rhythm can be described as 1:2:1:2.
- There are no irregular or oversized windows.
- Within the window pattern the single windows are recessed from the face of the exterior wall by approximately 4 inches. The double windows are not recessed, but do have an overhanging metal grill sun screen.
- The exterior stucco material is colored in a banded sand/warm grey color scheme, also with a regular pattern to the color bands matching the rows of windows.

This design response provides articulation and variation of depth and color, but with order and continuity. As the color scheme wraps around to the Broadway facade it becomes integrated with the sand-colored band across the top of that facade. The alternating color scheme, shadow recesses of the single windows,

and the alternating shadow pattern of the sun shades all help to break down the visual mass of the building along MacArthur and Manila.

Across the Broadway façade, the glass surfaces vary in depth across the face of the building, providing depth and articulation. Also, the back side of the parking garage has a regularly-spaced pattern of horizontal and vertical elements interspersed with landscaping screens. This pattern provides more order and continuity than has been seen in previous designs.

C. Exterior Building Materials

Comments on previous design submittals have suggested that better, more permanent materials other than concrete plaster (stucco) should be considered for at least portions of the exterior skin of the building. Such materials could improve the overall design theme for the OMC campus, could be more reflective of building materials found in the surrounding neighborhood, and may wear better with less maintenance needs over the long term.

Kaiser's Design Response: Kaiser has maintained that they have had good success elsewhere with stucco as an exterior siding material and that other siding material such as pre-cast concrete, tile or stone would be cost-prohibitive. However, in this most recent design response most of the front (or Broadway) façade has become glass, with the only stucco remaining on the staircase near the parking garage and across the top of the building. The parking garage is clad an alternating pattern of cast in place smooth concrete and stucco. While stucco is still the predominant siding material across the MacArthur and Manila facades, in this new design a masonry brick or block product has been introduced in several key locations at the street level. These locations include:

- the plinth or base of the building along MacArthur and wrapping back around the Manila elevation to the serenity gardens,
- the first floor columns along Broadway,
- all of the planter boxes in the Broadway and MacArthur streetscape, and
- the exterior walls of the retail space on Broadway and 38th Street.

This current design response improves upon the palette of exterior siding materials. The glass, concrete and brick could set precedence for the overall design theme of the OMC campus, and is more complementary of the building materials found along the surrounding Broadway commercial corridor.

D. Solid Wall for Manila Side of Parking Garage

Many public comments suggested that the Manila side of the parking garage be designed as an attractive, architecturally interesting solid wall to reduce light and glare, vehicle emissions and traffic noise from the garage into the adjacent neighborhood. Kaiser's previous proposal had been an open-ventilated garage with intermittent openings covered with low metal-grill panels.

November submittal: Kaiser's most recent design response provides for a solid rear wall with no openings on the manila side. The current design includes; a) a landscaped buffer and the Glen

Echo Creek restoration plan; b) a series of large vine screens, c) a pattern of blue concrete plaster columns, and d) horizontal bands of cast in place smooth concrete stacked the full height of the garage.

These layers of material result in a well-composed design that also responds to the noise, light and emissions concerns associated with the parking garage.

E. Sustainability

The Kaiser OMC Master Plan guidelines require that sustainable design elements and features be incorporated into the Phase 1 design. The Commission has seen many of the sustainable elements of this proposal, including:

- the previously approved *Creek Restoration, Revegetation, and Planting Plan* to restore to a more natural condition the daylighted portion of Glen Echo Creek,
- native plants to be used for landscaping within the Creek area,
- grass-covered mounds to disperse and filter storm water and reduce surface runoff, and
- support for alternative modes of transportation including nearby bus stop, a shuttle drop off at the building entrance and preferential car pool parking and bike parking within the parking garage. A full TDM plan has been approved with specific requirements for Phase 1 operations.

November submittal: Kaiser has submitted a comprehensive list of sustainable design elements to be integrated into the building design and site plan, incorporating ideas from “Green Guidelines for Healthcare”. These sustainable building design elements are specifically described in the Sustainable Design Elements list (*Attachment F* to this staff report).

ADDITIONAL COMMUNITY OUTREACH

At the last DRC hearing on this item, the Committee asked Kaiser and staff to work together with a number of interested citizens to seek resolution on a number of design issues. Staff believes these issues are now resolved to the extent possible. During discussions with the community members, several additional issues were raised which have been addressed by new Conditions of Approval. These new conditions of approval respond to concerns about:

- details for the TDM program required for Phase 1, including bicycle parking,
- parking garage safety features to protect pedestrian and bicycles, and
- public review of the Master Sign Plan.

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff believes that the proposed project has been well designed and has now addressed most of the issues that have been raised throughout the Design Review process. Based on the analysis contained within this staff report, the Kaiser Permanente OMC Master Plan Project EIR and elsewhere within the administrative record, staff believes that the proposed project is appropriate in this location and is an attractively designed project. The proposed project will further the overall objectives of the General Plan by helping to create, maintain and enhance an area that is appropriate for health services and medical uses. Thus, staff recommends that the Planning Commission:

1. Find that the current Phase 1 Design Review project has been adequately reviewed, analyzed, and considered within the *Kaiser Permanente OMC Master Plan Project EIR* prior to acting on this approval; and
2. Re-affirm the attached Conditions of Approval for the Kaiser Permanente OMC Master Plan Project including the Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program as applicable to the Phase 1 project. The monitoring and reporting of CEQA mitigation measures in connection with the project will be conducted in accordance with the MMRP. Adoption of this program will constitute fulfillment of the CEQA monitoring and/or reporting requirement set forth in Section 21081.6 of CEQA. All proposed mitigation measures are capable of being fully implemented by the efforts of the City of Oakland or other identified public agencies of responsibility as set forth in the conditions of approval and the MMRP; and
3. Approve the Design Review applications subject to the attached Findings and Conditions of Approval.

Prepared by:

Scott Gregory

SCOTT GREGORY

Contract Planner

Approved for forwarding to the
City Planning Commission

GARY PATTON

Deputy Director of Planning and Zoning

Attachments:

- A. Staff report, September 6th Planning Commission consideration of the Kaiser Phase 1 Design Review
- B. Staff report, September 27th Design Review Committee consideration of the Kaiser Phase 1 Design Review
- C. Findings for Approval, Phase 1 Medical Office Building and Parking Garage Design Review
- D. Conditions of Approval (including Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program) for the Phase 1 MOB Design Review
- E. Kaiser/ NBBJ, November Design Review application materials
- F. Kaiser/ NBBJ, Sustainable Design Elements