

Oakland City Planning Commission
Design Review Committee

STAFF REPORT

Case File Number CMD06-284

September 27, 2006

Project Name:	Kaiser Permanente, Broadway Medical Office Building and Parking Garage, OMC Master Plan Phase 1
Location:	Generally the western side of the 3700 block of Broadway between West MacArthur Boulevard and 38 th Street, plus two extensions of these properties through the mid-block to Manila Avenue
Proposal:	Kaiser Permanente has requested Design Review approval for their Phase I Medical Office Building and parking garage.
Applicant:	Kaiser Permanente, Kaiser Foundation Health Plan Michael Lane, Project Director, Kaiser Permanente (510) 987-2373
Owner:	Kaiser Permanente, plus 1 additional property on Broadway yet to be acquired by Kaiser
Case File Number:	CMD06-284 / ER05-0004
General Plan:	Institutional
Zoning:	KX (Kaiser Permanente Zone)
Historic Status:	No historic structures
Environmental Determination:	A Draft EIR was released on March 2, 2006 and the public comment period on the Draft EIR ended on April 17, 2006. The Final EIR was released on May 26, 2006. The EIR was certified by the Oakland Planning Commission on June 6, 2006
Service /Council District:	North Oakland, Council District 1
Staff Recommendation:	Receive additional public and Committee comments on the Design Review application
For further information:	Contact: Scott Gregory , contract planner to the City at 510-535-6690, or by email at kaiser@lamphier-gregory.com

SUMMARY

The public process for consideration of Design Review for Kaiser's proposed Phase 1 Medical Office Building (MOB) and associated parking garage has included the following meetings to date:

- On July 5th the Design Review Committee (DRC) was presented with the first design plans for Kaiser's proposed Phase 1 MOB and associated parking garage and with a critique of the Phase 1 building prepared by the City's urban design consultant, SMWM. The DRC heard

public testimony and identified certain design issues that they felt needed more work by Kaiser and their design team.

- On July 26th the DRC was presented with a design response by Kaiser's architects, NBBJ, intending to respond to the DRC's previous comments and concerns. The DRC expressed reservations regarding certain aspects of the redesign, but felt that the design was ready to be considered by the full Planning Commission at the next available meeting.
- On September 9th the Planning Commission considered Kaiser's proposed redesigned submittal for the Phase 1 MOB and parking garage, together with a Creek Protection Permit. The Commission approved the Creek Protection Permit but did not approve Design Review for the MOB and parking garage. Instead, the Commission referred the application back to the DRC for further design work and community input.

The purpose of this report is to set context for the DRC's further consideration of Design Review for Phase 1 of the Kaiser Oakland Medical Center (OMC) Master Plan. In reflecting on the design of the MOB and parking lot, the DRC may also wish to consider the future context for this building. In the future, the centerpiece building for the Kaiser Oakland Medical Center will eventually be the new main hospital at the former M\B Center block. The 5-story MOB and parking garage will become much more understated once the surrounding context buildings are constructed than it will be during Phase I.

RESOLVED DESIGN ISSUES

It is the understanding of staff that there has been several design issues discussed to date by the DRC and the Commission that have generally been resolved. These resolved issues include:

1. Consistent with the approved Master Plan, the medical office building will be located at the corner of West MacArthur Boulevard and Broadway (see **Attachment A, pg. 1** from Kaiser's September 7th Planning Commission submittal). It will be approximately 165,000 square feet in size and 5-stories (approximately 86 feet) tall at its highest point.
2. The function of this building as a medical office space is essential. The floor plan of internal space therefore may dictate or define certain aspects of the external space (i.e., window locations and spacing, entrance location, etc).
3. A free-standing parking garage will be located adjacent to the MOB (see also Attachment A, pg. 1). Consideration of an integrated building combining medical office and parking uses underneath one roof has been addressed and dismissed as being non-functional and inefficient for Kaiser's medical-related use.
4. The street level space within the parking garage along the Broadway street frontage, from the parking garage entry to 38th Street, is to be established as pedestrian-oriented retail space. The retail use includes 3 main retail spaces along Broadway, a retail support space behind a shear wall, and internal circulation for each retail space as shown on the Retail Floor Plan in the September 7th version of Kaiser's plans (see **Attachment A, pgs 2, 3 and 4**).

5. The parking garage shall provide for a maximum of 2 stories of parking (3 decks with roof-top parking) over the first-floor of retail frontage along Broadway, resulting in a maximum height of the parking garage of 3 stories. With 2 levels of underground parking this structure contains approximately 520 parking spaces (or about 580 spaces if valet parking is used).
6. The property that extends from the MOB to Manila Avenue is to be developed as a passive park / private open space area. The design plan for this space and for the adjacent Glen Echo Creek Restoration area is as shown on the West Garden Landscape Plan and the Glen Echo Creek Restoration Plan from the September 7th version of Kaiser's Design submittal (see **Attachment A, pgs 5 and 6**).
7. The landscape and streetscape plans for West MacArthur Boulevard and Broadway provide street front landscaping, median landscaping and street/sidewalk improvements. The design plan for streetscape and landscape improvements is as conceptually illustrated on the Street Level Experience, MacArthur Garden and MacArthur Section drawings from the September 7th version of Kaiser's Design submittal (see **Attachment A, pgs 7, 8 and 9**).

UNRESOLVED DESIGN ISSUES

It is also the understanding of staff that there are numerous design issues, some discussed by the DRC and the Commission and other perhaps not fully discussed, that remain unresolved. Some of the remaining unresolved issues include:

1. The architectural interest and articulation of the large west (Manila) and south (MacArthur Boulevard) elevations did not fully satisfy the Commission. Comments expressed by the Commissioners indicated their opinion was that these walls were still too flat, required more (or different) articulation in order to help break down their scale, and were uninteresting or not orderly.
2. Commissioners also expressed a lack of satisfaction with the east (Broadway) elevation. Comments here also suggested that the building was uninteresting and that the proposed building materials (stucco cement with different colors) did not set the appropriate tone for the overall development within the OMC campus. Suggestions by the Commission included use of more glass, and using a different and perhaps more permanent material for the "blue framing" along the east (Broadway) elevation. It should be noted that neither the DRC nor the attending public had previously raised concerns about the Broadway elevation design and its "blue frame".
3. The front door for the MOB is still not clearly defined.
4. Broadway/MacArthur corner deserves yet more design attention given its prominent location. This corner could use more activity and more transparency from the building.
5. The light wells as proposed in earlier versions of the MOB design exposed a large concrete base, or plinth that seemed out of scale in some of the earlier Kaiser drawings. These light wells have now been removed (see **Attachment A, pgs 10 and 11**) but the

lower level of the building is now without sunlight. Staff is not sure that this has been the best solution and Kaiser has also raised some concerns and doubts as well.

Other issues that have been either unresolved or as yet not addressed during Design Review discussions include:

6. Several neighbors from within the Manila neighborhood have suggested that the rear (Manila) side of the parking garage be a solid wall with architectural interest. A solid wall would reduce light and glare, vehicle emissions and traffic noise from the garage into their neighborhood. The current proposal is for an open-ventilated garage with intermittent openings covered with low metal-grill panels to shield headlight glare.
7. The Kaiser OMC Master Plan guidelines require that sustainable design elements and features be incorporated. The current design does include many sustainable elements including:
 - the previously approved *Creek Restoration, Revegetation, and Planting Plan* to restore to a more natural condition the daylighted portion of Glen Echo Creek located within the Oakland Medical Center.
 - Native plants are proposed for landscaping within the Creek area.
 - The proposed grass-covered mounds within the MacArthur landscaping plan would use the topography to disperse storm water through these biological filters for filtration and irrigation. This area provides a permeable site surfaces to also reduce surface runoff.
 - The site design also supports alternative modes of transportation use by staff and visitors, with a bus stop at the Broadway/MacArthur corner, a shuttle drop off at the building entrance and preferential car pool parking and bike parking within the parking garage. Additionally, a full TDM plan has been approved with specific requirements for Phase 1 operations.

Sustainable design elements not yet discussed include specifically how the building design and site planning incorporates “Green Guidelines for Healthcare”; how the building design will efficiently use water in site design, utility uses, cooling systems and landscape irrigation; how the design promotes energy efficiency; and specifically where in the building design are sustainable materials and resources used.

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

- 1) Open the public hearing on the Kaiser OMC Phase 1 Design Review. Take public comments on the issues and consider a more open, public workshop-type format to provide greater opportunity for public involvement. .
- 2) Provide direction to staff and the applicant as to the Committees' suggestions, recommendations and thoughts regarding the remaining unresolved Phase 1 design issues.

Prepared by:

Scott Gregory

SCOTT GREGORY

Contract Planner

Approved for forwarding to the
City Planning Commission Design Review Committee:

GARY PATTON

Deputy Director of Planning and Zoning

Attachments:

A: Portions of Kaiser's September 7th 2006 presentation to the Oakland Planning Commission