

***Oakland City Planning Commission***  
***Design Review Committee***

**STAFF REPORT**

Case File Number ER05-0004//GP06-136/RZ06-137/PUDF06-139

July 26, 2006

|                                     |   |
|-------------------------------------|---|
| <b>Project Name:</b>                | <b>Kaiser Permanente, Broadway Medical Office Building and Parking Garage, OMC Master Plan Phase 1</b>  |
| <b>Location:</b>                    | Generally the western side of the 3700 block of Broadway between West MacArthur Boulevard and 38 <sup>th</sup> Street, plus two extensions of these properties through the mid-block to Manila Avenue   |
| <b>Proposal:</b>                    | Kaiser Permanente has requested Design Review approval for their Phase I Medical Office Building and parking garage and a Creek Protection Permit. Planning permits required prior to consideration of approval of Design Review include a General Plan Amendment, Redevelopment Plan Amendment, Rezoning and Master Plan approval. These matters are currently before the City Council, with first reading scheduled for June 27 <sup>th</sup> and second reading scheduled for July 18 <sup>th</sup> . Subsequent permits ultimately required include Tree Removal Permit, Demolition Permit and Building Permit. |
| <b>Applicant:</b>                   | Kaiser Permanente, Kaiser Foundation Health Plan<br>Michael Lane, Project Director, Kaiser Permanente (510) 987-2373  |
| <b>Owner:</b>                       | The Project site includes those properties currently owned by Kaiser Permanente, and additional properties which must ultimately be incorporated into the site but which Kaiser Permanente does not currently own   |
| <b>Case File Number:</b>            | ER05-0004//GP06-136/RZ06-137/PUDF06-139   |
| <b>General Plan:</b>                | Community Commercial and Mixed Housing Type Residential   |
| <b>Zoning:</b>                      | C-40/S-18 (Community Thoroughfare Commercial/Mediated Design Review Combining Zone), and R-70/S-18 (High Density Residential/Mediated Design Review Combining Zone)   |
| <b>Historic Status:</b>             | No historic structures  |
| <b>Environmental Determination:</b> | A Draft EIR was released on March 2, 2006 and the public comment period on the Draft EIR ended on April 17, 2006. The Final EIR was released on May 26, 2006. The EIR was certified by the Oakland Planning Commission on June 6, 2006  |
| <b>Service /Council District:</b>   | North Oakland, Council District 1   |
| <b>Staff Recommendation:</b>        | Receive public and Committee comments on the Design Review application  |
| <b>For further information:</b>     | Contact: <b>Scott Gregory</b> , contract planner to the City at 510-535-6690, or by email at <a href="mailto:kaiser@lamphier-gregory.com">kaiser@lamphier-gregory.com</a>   |

## **BACKGROUND**

On July 5<sup>th</sup>, staff provided a staff report to the Design Review Committee that included a description of Kaiser's proposed Phase 1 medical office building and associated parking garage. The staff report also included a critique of the Phase 1 building prepared by the City's urban design consultant, SMWM and an overview of the chief design concerns held by staff. Kaiser followed with a presentation of certain changes and design solutions to some of the criticisms and concerns expressed in the staff report.

The Committee heard public testimony and then each member of the Committee present identified the design issues that they felt needed more work or further consideration. A list of these concerns is as follows:

### **Commissioner Lee:**

1. The west elevation of the parking garage (that facing Manila Avenue) that has landscape screen attached did not seem to work well. That building side needed more articulation and variation, but with order and continuity.
2. The west elevation of the Medical Office Building (MOB) also that facing Manila Avenue and MacArthur Boulevard has too many small punch windows and few irregular window treatments look forced, not integrated.
3. The east elevation of the MOB facing Broadway needs to set the tone for the entire OMC campus. Better, more permanent materials than stucco should be considered, such as pre-cast concrete, tile or stone.
4. The corner at Broadway /MacArthur needs a strong presence and the current design feels weak at this location.
5. The retail space needs continuity across the entire Broadway frontage of the parking structure. The cut-out parking area breaks up the flow of retail window space along the streetscape.
6. The entry into the MOB from Broadway needs to be more prominent.
7. The light wells along Broadway seem problematic and may work better along MacArthur instead.
8. The tall concrete base, or plinth of the MOB, particularly along MacArthur, needs more design work.
9. Trees immediately adjacent to the MOB and across the street from Moswood Park should not be so tall as to obscure views from the building to the park.

**Commissioner Jang:**

1. The function of the building as a medical office space associated with a hospital is paramount over integrated building concepts, if such concepts care not feasible.
2. The “blue space” on the Broadway façade with the large glass inside provides interest along the building’s frontage.
3. The west and south elevation (facing Manila and West MacArthur Boulevard) have too much mass and need to be broken down visually.
4. Would like to see a life-cycle cost analysis to consider different materials other than stucco.
5. The layers of landscaping and vine screens work to give the building rhythm.
6. Any more active-type uses in the Serenity Garden should not be adjacent to the abutting residence.
7. Where are sidewalk bulb-out for busses, shuttle and car drop-offs – especially along Broadway?

Commissioner Lighty was not in attendance.

**KAISER’S DESIGN RESPONSE**

Kaiser’s architect, NBBJ, has prepared design responses to the comments and concerns that have been expressed by staff and the Committee members. Some of these design responses (in small size format) are included as attachments to this staff report.

Kaiser and their architects intend to present these design responses, with detailed explanations about how they believe these designs respond to the specific concerns described above, to the Committee on June 26th.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:**

- 1) Open the public hearing on the Kaiser OMC Master Plan, Phase 1 Design Review. Take additional public comments on the issues.
- 2) Provide direction to staff and the applicant as to the Committees’ suggestions, recommendations and thoughts regarding the Phase 1 design.
- 3) If the Committee is satisfied that Kaiser has responded appropriately to the Committee’s previous comments, or any remaining comments can be addressed in front of the full Planning Commission, then the Committee may forward this item (with any additional comments and/or recommendations) on to the full Planning Commission. The next available Planning Commission agenda to consider Design Review for Phase 1 of the Kaiser MOB is August 16, 2006.

Prepared by:

*Scott Gregory*

SCOTT GREGORY

Contract Planner

Approved for forwarding to the  
City Planning Commission Design Review Committee:

---

GARY PATTON  
Deputy Director of Planning and Zoning

Attachments:

- A. Kaiser Permanente's Design Response packet